Contents

Introduction xi

Acknowledgments xvii

Chapter 1: Informal Logic Methods for Law 1
1. Basics of Argument Diagramming 2
2. *Araucaria* 5
3. Legal Origins of Argument Diagramming 8
4. Argumentation Schemes 10
5. Enthymemes 14
6. Burden of Proof 16
7. Types of Dialogue 21
8. Commitment Operations in Dialogues 28
9. Legal and Everyday Argumentation 30
10. The Level of Difficulty of the Problems 31

Chapter 2: Generalizations in Legal Reasoning 35
1. The Necessity and Danger of Generalizations 36
2. The Fallacy of Hasty Generalization 39
3. Generalizations in Evidence Law 42
4. Argumentation Schemes 44
5. Analysis of the Cranberry Cask Case 48
6. Deductive and Inductive Generalizations 54
7. The Third Type of Generalization 56
8. Defeasible Generalizations and Arguments from Ignorance 63
9. Abstraction and the Defeasible Quantifier 67
10. Evaluating Argumentation Based on Generalizations 71

Chapter 3: Defeasible Reasoning in Dialogue Systems 75
1. Common Argumentation Schemes in Legal Evidence 76
2. Defeasible Arguments 78
3. Arguments Based on Case Comparison 83
4. Theories of Defeasible Reasoning 86
5. Computational Dialectics for Legal Argumentation 89
6. Formal Dialogue Systems 92
7. Lack of Knowledge Inferences 96
8. Other Argumentation Schemes in Evidence Law 103
9. Dialogue Conditions for Defeasible Arguments 108
10. The Dialectical Approach to Defeasible Arguments 110

Chapter 4: Relevance Determinations of Legal Evidence 115
1. Logical Relevance 116
2. Legal Relevance 117
3. Examples of Relevance Determinations 120
4. Determination of Relevance by Argument Extrapolation 125
5. Probative Weight and Enthymemes 129
6. Conditional Relevance 132
7. Summary of the Method 137
8. The Problem of Diagnosing Fallacies of Relevance 138
9. Legal Relevance as a Procedural Concept 141

Chapter 5: Methods Applied to Problems of Evidence 143
1. Case-Based Reasoning 144
2. Argument Diagramming for Case-Based Reasoning 147
3. Witness Testimony as Evidence 150
4. Examination 152
5. Circumstantial Evidence 157
6. Abductive Reasoning 159
7. Forensic Evidence 162
8. Character Evidence 167
9. Evaluation of Evidence 169

Chapter 6: Dialectical Explanation in AI 173
1. Systems for Explanation in Computing 174
2. Philosophical Views of Explanation 178
3. A Review of the Logic of Generalizations 183
4. Logical and Pragmatic Aspects of an Explanation 186
5. Explanation and Argument 192
6. The Pragmatics of Explanation 195
7. Evaluating Explanations as Better or Best 199
8. Different Kinds of Understanding 202
9. Understanding and the Clarifying Function 205
10. Main Features of the New Dialectical Model 208

Chapter 7: Argument Invention for Proof Preparation 213
1. Argument Invention as a Search Process 214
2. An Easy Case of Argument Invention 218
3. Breach of Contract Case 222
4. Relevance and Invention 225
5. Building a Method of Argument Invention 230
6. Classifying and Formalizing Schemes 233
7. Studying Causal Schemes 236
8. Ten Components of Legal Argumentation 240
9. Future Problems for Research 242
10. A Procedural Model of Legal Argumentation 244

References 249

Index 261